

A SIMPLE PROOF OF A THEOREM OF KARRASS AND SOLITAR

DELARAM KAHROBAEI AND DELARAM KAHROBAEI

To Katalin Bencsáth

ABSTRACT. In this note we give a particularly short and simple proof of the following theorem of Karrass and Solitar. Let H be a finitely generated subgroup of a free group F with infinite index $[F : H]$. Then there is a nontrivial normal subgroup N of F such that $N \cap H = \{1\}$.

1. INTRODUCTION

As stated in the abstract, the purpose of this note is to present a proof of a theorem of Karrass and Solitar [5] which is particularly short and simple. This result was also proved by Ivanov and Schupp in [4] who were apparently not aware of [5].

In [1] and [2] (problem F22), P. Neumann asks the following question: *Is it possible that the free product $\{A * B; H = K\}$ with amalgamation, where A, B are free groups of finite ranks, H, K are finitely generated subgroups of A, B , respectively, is a simple group?* In desire of finding the answer to this problem, I arrived at the proof, recorded below, to the following well-known theorem of Karrass and Solitar. Note that as mentioned in [4], the theorem gives a partial answer to the question of P. Neumann, that under the same condition of the problem, $\{A * B; H = K\}$ is not simple provided either of indices $[A : H], [B : K]$ is infinite. Needless to mention that in [7], Burger and Mozes constructed an example of an amalgamated product of finitely generated free groups, with finitely generated amalgamated subgroup, which is simple. The reader may want to recall the familiar sounding but very different fact that if H is of *finite* index then $H \cap K$ is non-trivial for *all* non-trivial $K < F$, (see pg. 20, [6]).

In the proof of the theorem we use a theorem of M. Hall [3] which states that a finitely generated subgroup of a finitely generated free group is a free factor of a subgroup of finite index.

2. MAIN THEOREM AND PROOF

1. Theorem: *Let H be a finitely generated subgroup of a free group F with infinite index $[F : H]$. Then there is a nontrivial normal subgroup N of F such that $N \cap H = \{1\}$.*

Date: 2004; to appear in AMS Proceedings, Contemporary Mathematics.

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification. 20E05.

Key words and phrases. finitely generated subgroup, normal subgroup, free group.

The research of the author was partially supported by the NSF, Grant 402350001.

Proof. By a theorem of M. Hall [3], H is a free factor of a subgroup $K = H * Q$ which has finite index in F . Since H has infinite index, Q must be nontrivial. There are only finitely many conjugates of K in F and their intersection C is a normal subgroup of F of finite index with $C \leq K = H * Q$.

By the Kurosh subgroup theorem $C = (C \cap H) * J$ for some subgroup J . Since C has finite index in K , J is nontrivial. Let $L = \text{gp}_C(J)$ be the normal closure of J in C . Then $L \cap H = L \cap (C \cap H) = \{1\}$.

Let $b_1 = 1, b_2, \dots, b_n$ be a complete system of coset representatives for C in F . Conjugation by b_i induces an automorphism of C and so each L^{b_i} is normal in C . The intersection $N = \cap_{i=1}^n L^{b_i}$ is clearly normal in F . Also N contains the nontrivial subgroup $[L^{b_1}, L^{b_2}, \dots, L^{b_n}]$ because each L^{b_i} is normal in C . Finally $N \cap H = \{1\}$ since $N \leq L$, so N is the desired nontrivial normal subgroup. $\square$

Acknowledgement. I would like to thank G.Baumslag, C.F.Miller and the anonymous referee for their suggestions.

REFERENCES

- [1] *New York Group Theory Cooperative at CCNY*, <http://grouptheory.org>.
- [2] G. Baumslag and A. G. Myasnikov and V. Shpilrain, *Open problems in combinatorial group theory. Second edition. Combinatorial and geometric group theory*, Contemp. Math. **296** (2002), 1–38.
- [3] M. Hall Jr., *Subgroups of finite index in free groups*, Canad. J. Math. **1** (1949), 187–190.
- [4] S. V. Ivanov and P. E. Schupp, *A remark on finitely generated subgroups of a free group*, in “Algorithmic problem in groups and semigroups (Lincoln NE, 1998)”, (J.-C. Birget, S. Margolis, J. Meakin, M. Sapir, Eds.), Trends in Mathematics, Birkhauser, Boston (2000), 139–142.
- [5] A. Karrass and D. Solitar, *On finitely generated subgroups of a free group*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **22** (1969), 209–213.
- [6] R. C. Lyndon and P. E. Schupp, *Combinatorial Group Theory*, in “Classics in Mathematics”, Springer-Verlag, Berlin (1977).
- [7] M. Burger and S. Mozes, *Finitely presented simple groups and products of trees*, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Serie I Math. **7** (1997), 747–752.

DELARAM KAHROBAEI, MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE, UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS, NORTH HAUGH, ST ANDREWS, FIFE KY16 9SS SCOTLAND, UK

E-mail address: delaram.kahrobaei@st-andrews.ac.uk

URL: <http://www-groups.mcs.st-and.ac.uk/~delaram/>